THE CLOSED SHOP IN BRITAIN

By

W. E. J. McCARTHY

92

BASIL BLACKWELL · OXFORD

In the first intensive study which has ever been made of this controversial subject, Dr. McCarthy shows that the Closed Shop—or Trade Union Membership as a condition of employment—is a natural and often essential objective of British trade unions. He proves that demands for the practice are increasing, and that it already covers a majority of organized manual workers. Many employers welcome the Closed Shop and the majority are prepared to come to terms with it.

The author argues that the spread of the practice can best be understood by an analysis of its positive functions. He examines the case for and against it and concludes that, while it can be said to involve a restriction of civil liberties, the Closed Shop is, generally, a valuable and justifiable phenomenon. The book ends with a number of suggestions for correcting potential abuses, some of which require legal regulation.

This work is essential reading, both for those who study Industrial Relations, and for those many trades unionists and employers who have to face the issues which are discussed.

3 5s. net

NCI Library
3 9006 01054068 2

NAL COLLEGE
LIBRARY
INDUSTRIAL RELATIONS

THE CLOSED SHOP IN BRITAIN

NAL COLLEGE
LIBRARY
OF INDUSTRIAL RELATIONS

By

W. E. J. McCARTHY

CATHOLIC WORKERS
DIRECTORS LIBRARY
COLLEGE

BASIL BLACKWELL
OXFORD
1964

© *Basil Blackwell & Mott, Ltd., 1964*

First printed in 1964

Printed in Great Britain for Basil Blackwell & Mott, Ltd.
by A. R. Mowbray & Co. Limited in the City of Oxford
and bound at the Kemp Hall Bindery

In Memoriam

E. M.

CONTENTS

PART ONE

DESCRIPTION AND FUNCTIONS

CHAP.		PAGE
1.	THE NATURE OF THE CLOSED SHOP	3
	(1) The Factual Vacuum	3
	(2) Objections to the term 'The Closed Shop'	7
	(3) Variations Within the Practice	16
	(*a*) Variations in Form	16
	(*b*) Variations in Enforcement	20
	(*c*) Variations in Scope	22
	(*d*) Minor Variations	23
	(4) The Semi-Closed Shop	24
2.	THE CLOSED SHOP PATTERN	27
	(1) Sources of Information	27
	(2) The Extent of the Practice	28
	(*a*) Comprehensively Closed Trades	30
	(*b*) Mainly Closed Trades	30
	(*c*) Mainly Open Trades	30
	(*d*) Comprehensively Open Trades	30
	(3) Varations in Form	37
	(*a*) The Labour Supply Shop	38
	(*b*) The Labour Pool Shop	42
	(*c*) The Craft Qualification Shop	45
	(*d*) The Promotion Veto Shop	49
	(*e*) Post-Entry Shops	52
	(4) Variations in Enforcement	52
	(*a*) Coal Miners	53
	(*b*) Dockers	55
	(*c*) Scottish Bakers	56
	(*d*) London Transport Workers	56
	(*e*) Entertainment Workers	57
	(*f*) Co-operative Workers	58
	(*g*) The Limits of Informal Recognition	62
	(*h*) Closed Shop Strikes	64

CHAP. PAGE
(5) Variations in Scope 67
(a) Craftsmen 67
(b) Non-Craftsmen 68
(c) Regional Variations 72
(6) Minor Variations 74
(7) Analogous Practices in the Professions . . 75
(8) General Summary 78

3. Some Explanations for the Closed Shop . . 80
(1) The Demand for Trade Union Solidarity . . 81
(2) The Effect of the Closed Shop on Solidarity . . 84
(3) The Employers' Role 88
(4) The Questions to be Answered . . . 93

4. The Functions of the Closed Shop . . . 95
(1) Job Regulation and Union Sanction . . . 95
(2) The Functions of the Closed Shop . . . 97
(a) The Membership Function . . . 97
(b) The Discipline Function . . . 99
(c) The Entry Control Function . . . 105

5. Factors Affecting Demands for the Closed Shop . 107
(1) Problems of Organizing the Labour Force . . 107
(a) Problems of Turnover and Contact . . 108
(b) The Problem of Inter-Union Competition . 110
(c) The Problem of Worker Indifference . . 111
(2) Problems of Controlling the Labour Force . . 111
(a) The Problem of Enforcing Unilateral Regulations 111
(b) The Problem of Strike Solidarity. . . . 114
(c) The Example of Coal Mining . . . 115
(d) The Example of Car Manufacture . . 119
(e) The Problem of Strike Control . . . 122
(f) The Example of Iron and Steel . . . 122
(3) Problems of Organizing or Controlling the Alternative Labour Force 125
(a) Unskilled Groups 126
(b) Skilled Groups 134
(c) The Examples of Printing and Shipbuilding . 136
(d) Exclusiveness versus Comprehensiveness . . 141

CHAP. PAGE
(4) The Influence of Group Morality and the Closed Shop Tradition 143
(5) The Attitude of Unions and their Officials to the Closed Shop 145
(6) The Argument So Far 146

6. An Explanation of the Closed Shop Pattern . . 148
(1) Limitations on Union Power . . . 148
(2) Groups where the Closed Shop is Prevalent . . 149
(a) Craftsmen 150
(b) Lesser Skilled Pre-entry Groups . . . 150
(c) The Post-Entry Trades 152
(d) Process Workers in Iron and Steel . . 157
(e) Entertainment Workers 158
(f) Employer-Initiated Closed Shops . . . 159
(3) The Relative Importance of the Closed Shop in Different Trades 160
(4) Well-Organized Groups in which the Closed Shop is not Prevalent 161
(5) Summary 175

Part Two
JUSTIFICATION

7. The Issues Involved 179
(1) Introductory 179
(2) The Common Obligation Argument . . 179

8. The Right to Exclude Non-Members from the Job . 185
(1) The Removal of Criminal Liability . . . 185
(a) Legal Justifiability 185
(b) The Royal Commission of 1867 . . . 186
(c) The Reforms Proposed by the Majority Report . 187
(d) The Argument of the Minority Report . . 189
(e) Voluntary versus Non-Voluntary Trade Union Regulation: the terms of the closed shop debate . 192
(f) The Results of the Royal Commission . . 198

CHAP. PAGE

(2) The Removal of Civil Liability . . . 199
(a) The Period before 1906 200
(b) The 1906 Act and After 207
(3) The Present Position and its Rationale . . 214
(a) The Limits of Existing Immunity . . 214
(b) The Rationale of the Present Position . . 216

9. The Right to Exclude Ex-Members from the Job . 223
(1) The Authorization Principle 223
(2) Natural Justice 226

10. Contemporary Criticism 231
(1) Suggestions for a Restrictive Practices Court for Labour 231
(a) The Existing Court 231
(b) Objections to the Proposal . . . 236
(2) Suggestions for Circumscribing the Right to Reject Applicants 241
(3) Suggestions for Extending the Basis of Legal Control over Expulsion Rules 245
(a) Common Law Jurisdiction . . . 245
(b) Statutory Control 252

11. Conclusions and Suggestions 256
(1) The Continued Justifiability of the Closed Shop . 256
(2) Proposals for Reform 262
(a) Restrictions on the Right to Exclude Non-Members 262
(b) Restrictions on the Right to Exclude Ex-Members 267
(c) Possible Restrictions on the Right to Exclude Existing Members 275
(3) Conclusions 279

APPENDIX 282

TABLE OF STATUTES AND CASES CITED . . 287

INDEX 289

INDEX

Individual trade unions and professional associations will be found indexed under the general heading Trade Unions and Professional Associations. Items which are treated in the text specifically in their relation to the closed shop will be found indexed under Closed Shop.

Adams, Rex, 153, 284
Allen, V. L., 5–7, 59, 80, 84, 87–90, 104, 258, 271f.
Apprenticeship Ratios, 18, 38, 46, 136–8, 140
Askwith, G. R., 205n., 206f., 218n., 219
Authorization Principle, 223–6

Barou, N., 4, 6
Bevin, Ernest, 42
Bilateral Regulation, 98
Blacklegs, 6 (*see also* Scabs)
Booth, James, 188f., 191
Brewer, A. A., 166
Bridlington Agreement, 13, 253n., 274n.
Briggs Motor Bodies, 1, 97
British Broadcasting Corporation, 41, 69
British Motor Corporation, 15n.
British Overseas Airways Corporation, 212

Campbell, Alan, 234f.
Carr-Saunders, A. M., 75, 247n.
Chamberlain, N. W., 237, 256
Check Off, 23f., 54, 60, 74, 154
Citrine, N. A., 199n., 204, 227n., 228
Civil Service Arbitration Tribunal, 163
Clegg, H. A., vii, 145, 153, 201n., 276, 284
Closed Shop:
  and group morality, 143–5, 155f., 159, 166
  and solidarity, 80–88
  definition of, 3
  economic effects of, 188–96, 259f.
  employers' role and attitudes towards, 88–93, 167f., 171
  extent of the practice, 28–37, 78f.
Closed Shop Functions:
  entry control function, 17, 51, 56, 97, 132–43, 158, 161, 183, 194–7, 259
  discipline function, 97, 99–104
  membership function, 96–9
Closed Shop Position in Various Trades and Groups:
  actors, 57
  Admiralty workers, 47, 67, 79, 110
  American workers, 80
  bakers, 30, 53, 69, 92n., 125, 149
  boot and shoe workers, 36, 172–5
  builders and civil engineering workers, 28f., 32, 36, 65, 68, 71, 74, 109f., 148f., 157 161–8
  chemical and oil-refinery workers, 29, 31, 61, 65, 70, 90, 109, 118
  civil servants, 36, 63, 90, 162–8
  clerical and administrative workers, 34–6, 159
  clothing workers, 29, 35, 60, 70, 118, 149, 153
  comprehensively closed trades, 30, 63
  comprehensively open trades, 30
  coal miners, 29f., 32, 53f., 63, 65, 69, 80f., 115–18, 152f.
  cotton workers, 35, 67

Closed Shop Position in Various Trades and Groups—*continued*
co-operative workers, 32, 33n., 53, 58–62
craftsmen, 67f., 72
distribution workers, 29, 32, 65, 74, 161, 196, 257
dockers, 17, 29f., 37, 42, 53, 55f., 63, 69, 73f., 80f., 109, 112, 132f., 150, 155
draughtsmen, 31, 71, 155
electricians, 36, 58, 148, 169f., 288
engineering workers, 28f., 31f., 48, 60, 63–7, 69f., 90, 109, 118, 149, 153, 166, 257, 286
entertainment workers, 29, 53, 57f., 158f.
exhibition trade workers, 125
film and television workers, 31, 37, 41, 58, 150f., 158
firemen, 36, 168
fishermen, 29, 35, 37, 65, 133, 150
food, drink and tobacco workers, 29, 118, 153
gas workers, 35, 222
hatters, 30, 37, 41, 63
iron and steel workers, 29, 31, 38, 47, 49, 63, 65, 67, 156–8
iron foundry workers, 65, 74
journalists, 38
Labour Party staff, 31
local government workers, 29, 160, 288
London Transport workers, 53, 56f.
mainly closed trades, 30, 34, 90
mainly open trades, 30
maintenance workers, 68
manufacturing workers, not elsewhere specified, 29
motor-car workers, 199
musicians, 31, 57f., 63, 71, 112, 149, 158f., 161, 196, 257
newsprint workers, 17, 38
non-manual workers, 32
paper, box and carton workers, 29, 63, 65
passenger transport and car hire workers, 29, 35
pottery workers, 153
printers, 19, 29f., 32, 37f., 45, 47, 65, 67, 81, 113f., 132, 136–9, 150–2, 155, 257, 259
public utility workers, 29
railwaymen, 29, 31, 36, 65, 74, 169–72
road transport workers, 29, 47, 61, 65, 69, 110, 152, 154f., 161
seamen, 29f., 36f., 43–5, 63, 65, 69, 109, 126–32, 158, 161, 196, 257
service trades, 29
shipbuilding workers, 29f., 38, 47, 63, 65, 67, 69, 71, 74, 81, 139–41, 150, 155f., 161, 259
shop assistants, 160
small-scale metal manufacturing workers, 29, 48
teachers, 36, 75
textile workers, 29, 37f., 50, 65, 153
timber and furniture workers, 29, 35, 74
trade union officers and staff, 31, 90
veterinary surgeons, 32n.
wholesale market workers, 31, 37, 39f., 63, 114, 132, 150f.
Closed Shop, Problems giving rise to demands for:
enforcing unilateral regulations, 111–14, 151, 158, 169, 172
inter-union competition, 110f., 166f., 172
organizing and controlling the alternative labour force, 125–43, 150, 156–9, 166, 169, 172
strike control, 122–5, 157f., 174
strike solidarity, 114–22, 150, 152, 157, 169, 174
turnover and contact, 108–10, 150, 152–7, 165, 169, 172
worker indifference, 111
Closed Shop Prone Trades, 33–6, 78f., 89, 118, 149, 155
Closed Shop Strikes, 54, 64–6, 79, 88–92
Closed Shop, Trade Union Attitudes and Justifications for, 145f., 179–82

Closed Shop, Variations within the Practice:
enforcement variations, 52
formal recognition, 20, 52–64
informal recognition, 21f., 53f., 58, 62–4
union enforcement, 21f., 53–6, 58, 62–4
employer initiated closed shops, 59f., 159f.
form variations, 37
craft qualification shop, 19, 38, 45–9
labour pool shop, 17f., 37, 42–5
labour supply shop, 37f., 39, 41
post-entry shop, 16, 37, 52, 152–7, 183
pre-entry shop, 16
promotion veto shop, 20, 38, 49–51
minor variations, 23f., 74f.
regional variations, 72–4, 79
scope variations, 22f., 67–74
Cole, G. D. H., 5f.
Common Obligation Argument, 179–84
Compulsory Trade Unionism, 7–9
Conservative Party, 40n., 61
Conspiracy:
civil conspiracy, 199f., 202f., 203–7, 211, 222, 251
criminal conspiracy, 198f.
Co-operative Movement, 29

Deakin, Arthur, 180
Denning, Lord Alfred, 226, 227f., n., 245–8
Drage, Geoffrey, 4
Dunlop, J. T., 236
Durham County Council, 61

Elles, P. M., 234f.
Evans, Sir Lincoln, 124n.

Federation of Master Printers, 138
Flanders, Allan, vii, 18n., 20n., 201n., 257n.
Fox, Alan, vii, 173–5
Functional Justification, 261–81

Gallup Poll on Trade Unions, 3n., 82f.
Gardner, A. H., 215n.
Goldstein, J., 108, 271n.
Graham, F. P., viii, 100, 228f., 248n., 249
Grunfeld, Cyril, vii, 100n., 224n., 225–7

Hedges, R. W., 186n.
Hobsbawm, E. J., 132
Hodge, John, 123
Hopkins, Father, 127–9n.
Houghton, Douglas, 163n.
Howell, George, 4
Humphreys, R. V., 163n.

Inns of Court Conservative and Unionist Society, 233n., 242, 252, 254, 258, 267

Jeffrys, J. B., 142f., n.

Kahn-Freund, Otto, vii, 181n., 201n., 210, 256f.
Killick, A. J., 153, 284
Knowles, K. G. J. C., vii, 64, 91n., 115n.
Korgham, V. L., 233n.

Labour, Ministry of, 27f., 61, 64–6, 91n., 132n., 284f.
Labour Party, 61f., 90, 159
Leiserson, W. M., 80
Lerner, S. W., 12, 167n.
Lipset, S. M., 264–6
Lloyd, Dennis, 226n., 228, 229n., 247f.
London Passenger Transport Board, 57

Marsh, A. I., viii
McKelvey, J. T., 56–8
Membership Choice, 74
Meyers, F. W., 265, 273n.
Miller, G. W., 86n.
Milne-Bailey, W., 6f., 79
Ministry of Labour (*see* Labour, Ministry of)

National Arbitration Tribunal, 174n.
National Coal Board, 53f.
National Dock Labour Board, 42, 52, 132
National Incomes Commission, 240n.
National Labor Relations Board (U.S.A.), 263, 265
National Maritime Board, 44, 131
Natural Justice, 226–30, 267–9

'100 per cent Trade Unionism', 10f., 16
Open Union Principle, 243, 255
Open Shop Trades, 26, 32, 34, 89
Order 1376, 61
Oxford University Press, 63n.

Page-Arnot, R., 116f.
Parkinson J. R., 141n., 196n., 260
Pay Pause (1961), 164
Plymouth Brethren, 182n.
Professional Associations, 75–8
Pugh, Sir Arthur, 124

Registrar of Friendly Societies, 28n., 252f., 280, 284
Registration Shop, 120, 263–7, 279f.
Restrictive Practices Court, 231–4, 255
Rideout, R. W., viii
Right to Entry to a Union, 229
Right to Work Laws (U.S.A.), 264–6
Roberts, B. C., 7n.
Rosen, N., 86n.
Rottenburg, Simon, 40f., n., 114
Ruskin College, 287
Royal Commissions:
  on the Press (1961–2), 114, 196n., 239n., 244, 259
  on Trade Disputes and Trade Combinations (1903–5), 205n., 206f.
  on Trade Unions and other Associations (1867–9), 4, 186–99, 208–12, 255.
  on Labour (1894), 113
  on Civil Service Pay (1930–1 and 1953–5), 163n.

Scabs, 177 (*see also* Blacklegs)
Scottish Association of Master Bakers, 56
Screening, 20–22
Semi-closed shop, 24–6, 34, 36, 47, 53, 79, 153, 170f., 174
Shipping Federation, 44f., 126–30, 209
Skill gap, 134–43
Slessor, Henry, 6f.
Slichter, Sumner H., 264
Smith, George, 85

Smithfield Market, Report of the Court of Inquiry into Industrial Unrest in, 40
Society of West-End Theatre Managers, 57f.
Stone, Julius, 205n.
Sultan, Paul, 87n., 236n., 241, 263n., 265

Taft-Hartley Act (U.S.A.), 243n., 263, 264–6n.
Tannenbaum, Frank, 238
Thorne, Will, 133
Tillyard, Sir Frank, 23n.
Trade Dispute, definition of, 208f., 215f., 250–3
Trading Interest Defence, 201–5, 207, 209–13, 217–20, 250–2, 276f.
Trades Union Congress:
  annual reports, 11
  attitude towards closed shop, 180–2
  Disputes Committee, 12, 73, 75
  Interim Report on Structure and Closer Unity, 12–16
Trade Union Rule Books, 99–103, 248f., 253–75, 267–75, 280
Trade Unions and Professional Associations:
  Amalgamated Engineering Union, viii, 14, 46–8, 100n., 101, 111, 142f., 166, 249, 268, 272, 284f., 287
  Amalgamated Society of Journeymen Felt-Hatters, 41n.
  Amalgamated Society of Woodworkers, viii, 46, 68, 284f., 287
  Amalgamated Union of Building Trade Workers, 47, 143
  Amalgamated Union of Foundry Workers, 48
  Association of Broadcasting Staffs, 41
  Association of Cinematograph and Allied Technicians, 41, 58, 69
  Association of Locomotive Engineers and Firemen, 169
  British Iron, Steel and Kindred Trades Association, 49, 101, 104, 122–5, 131n., 268
  British Medical Association, 61, 77n.
  Civil Service Clerical Association, 154, 165
  Confederation of Heath Service Employees, 100n., 268
  Draughtsmen and Allied Technicians' Association, 212–14
  Electrical Trades Union, 170
  Equity, 57f.
  Fire Brigades Union, 168
  Musicians' Union, 112, 270n.
  National Association of Local Government Officers, 33n.
  National Association of Stevedores and Dockers, 42, 73f.
  National Passenger Workers' Union, 57, 110
  National Society of Operative Printers and Assistants, 38f., 114
  National Union of Blastfurnacemen, 49
  National Union of Boot and Shoe Operatives, 172–5
  National Union of Dyers, Bleachers and Textile Workers, 39
  National Union of General and Municipal Workers, 14, 15n., 39, 42, 110, 153, 170, 227n., 248, 272
  National Union of Labour Organizers and Election Agents, 160
  National Union of Mineworkers (including Miners' Federation of Great Britain), 53f., 116–18, 181n.
  National Union of Printing Bookbinding and Paper Workers, 38, 45, 102, 108n.
  National Union of Public Employees, 110
  National Union of Railwaymen, 169–71, 172n.
  National Union of Seamen, 43, 69
  National Union of Sheet Metal Workers, Braziers and Coppersmiths, 48
  National Union of Tailor and Garment Workers, 35
  National Union of Teachers, 61
  National Union of Vehicle Builders, 14, 48, 111, 143
  Post Office Engineering Union, 164–6, 167n.
  Scottish Union of Bakers and Allied Workers, 56, 92
  Scottish Transport and General Workers' Union, 42
  Tobacco Workers' Union, 35
  Transport and General Workers' Union, 14, 15n., 39f., 42, 45, 57f., 73f., 86, 104, 108, 110f., 153f., 211, 248

Trade Unions and Professional Associations—*continued*
Typographical Association, 136–9
Union of Post Office Workers, 164
Union of Shop, Distributive and Allied Workers, 58, 99n.
United Society of Boilermakers, Blacksmiths, Shipbuilders and Structural Workers, 46–8 100, 114, 139, 259, 270, 272
Watermen, Lighter, Tugmen and Bargemen's Union, 42
Trade Unionists in Closed Shops, 28, 33, 34, 37
Truck Acts, 23
Tupper, Captain Edward, 129f., 177
Turner, H. A., 51n.

Unilateral Regulation, 95, 111–14

Vester, H., 215n.

Wallis, George, 59f., n.
Webb, Beatrice and Sydney, 8, 112, 134, 179, 185, 189, 193–5, 198
Wedderburn, K. W., vii, 213n., 274n.
Whitmore, E. F., 247
Wilberforce, R. O., 234f.
Wiles, Peter, 259
Williams, Gertrude, 49, 140f.
Wilson, P. A., 75
Wilson, Havelock, 126, 129
Wooton, Barbara, 236n.

Zweig, F., 196n.

THE SYSTEM OF INDUSTRIAL RELATIONS IN GREAT BRITAIN

By A. FLANDERS and H. A. CLEGG

Demy 8vo 37*s.* 6*d. net*

TRADE UNION OFFICERS

By H. A. CLEGG, A. J. KILLICK and REX ADAMS

Demy 8vo 32*s.* 6*d. net*

BRITISH WAGES COUNCILS

By F. J. BAYLISS

Demy 8vo 25*s. net*