Ideology and Shop-floor Industrial Relations

P. J. Armstrong,
J.F.B. Goodman
and J.D. Hyman

Ideology and Shop-floor Industrial Relation
331.041

Since the publication of the Donovan Report industrial relations research has increasingly moved away from studies of formal procedures and institutions and focused more on informal custom and practice. As a consequence of this trend the workplace itself, rather than the wider industrial relations system, has come to be regarded as the key unit of analysis.

This book, based on data obtained in observational research amongst managers, shop stewards and workers, examines the informal processes by which accommodations are, or are not, reached by managers and workers. The authors develop a theory of workplace rule-making, and argue that it is in negotiations over such detailed and often minor daily industrial issues that the relationship between capital and labour is worked out.

P.J. Armstrong is Senior Lecturer in Industrial Relations in the Department of Management Studies at Huddersfield Polytechnic

J.F.B. Goodman is Frank Thomas Professor of Industrial Relations at the University of Manchester Institute of Science and Technology

J.D. Hyman is a Research Associate in the Department of Management Sciences at the University of Manchester Institute of Science and Technology

URNED BY:-

15 MAY 19[illegible]
- 7 NOV 1990
25 MAR 1992
1988
29 APR 1991
22 NOV 1993
23 FEB 1995
22 NOV 1993
12 FEB 1996
26 FEB 1996
23 JAN 1997
15 DEC 2003

ny Ltd
Ref: 1250

£12.95 net
in UK only

NCI Library
3 9006 01043316 9

College of Industrial Relations.
Rec. No. 979
STUDENTS' LIBRARY.

Since
indust
moved
and in
custor
trend
wider
be reg
Th
observ
shop s
inform
are, or
worke
workp
negoti
minor
ship b

P.J. A
Relati
Studie

J.F.B.
Indust
Manch

J.D. H
Depar
Univer
and Te

Ideology and Shop-floor Industrial Relations

P. J. Armstrong, J.F.B. Goodman and J.D. Hyman

College of Industrial Relations. Rec. No. 479
83/488
STUDENTS' LIBRARY.

CROOM HELM LONDON

Since t
industr
moved
and ins
custom
trend t
wider i
be rega
This
observa
shop st
informa
are, or
worker
workpl
negotia
minor c
ship be

P.J. Ar
Relatio
Studies

J.F.B. G
Industr
Manche

J.D. Hy
Departr
Univers
and Tec

© 1981 P.J. Armstrong, J.F.B. Goodman and J.D. Hyman
Croom Helm Ltd, 2-10 St. John's Road, London SW11

British Library Cataloguing in Publication Data

Armstrong, P J
Ideology and shop-floor industrial relations.
1. Industrial relations – Great Britain – Case Studies
I. Title II. Goodman, J F B
III. Hyman, J D
331'.0941 HD8391

ISBN 0-7099-0465-7

Printed in Great Britain by
Biddles Ltd, Guildford, Surrey

CONTENTS

List of Abbreviations

Preface and Acknowledgements

1. Introduction, Background and Methods 13

2. Theoretical Considerations 32

3. Management Rules and their Legitimisation 59

4. Workers' Resistance and Initiatives 86

5. Contested Legitimacy 120

6. Modes of Legitimisation 140

7. The Dialectic of Rules and Legitimisation 167

8. Ideology and Legitimisation in Action 187

Index 213

Since t
industr
moved
and ins
custom
trend t
wider i
be rega
This
observa
shop st
inform
are, or
worke
workp
negoti
minor
ship be

P.J. A
Relati
Studie

J.F.B.
Indust
Manch

J.D. H
Depar
Univer
and T

ABBREVIATIONS

ACAS	Advisory Conciliation and Arbitration Service
ASTMS	Association of Supervisory Technical and Managerial Staffs
AUEW	Amalgamated Union of Engineering Workers
C & P	custom and practice
EEPTU	Electrical, Electronic, Telecommunication and Plumbing Union
GMWU	General and Municipal Workers' Union
MDW	measured day work
NUFLAT	National Union of Footwear, Leather and Allied Trades
TGWU	Transport and General Workers' Union
The Firms:	
LEF	Lancashire Electrical Fittings
MoFoL	Moulded Footwear Limited
Pennine	Pennine Plastic Materials

INDEX

absence 16, 185
Advisory Conciliation and Arbitration Service (ACAS) 24
Amalgamated Union of Engineering Workers (AUEW) 21, 22, 24
arbitration 154
Armstrong, P.J. 34, 88
Association of Scientific, Technical and Managerial Staff (ASTMS) 22, 24, 26
attitudinal structuring 35, 47, 178-9
authority: distinguished from power 40, 41, 84; distribution of managerial 67, 193
average earnings calculation 147

Bain, G.S. 32
balance of power 55-6; apathy and 63; changes in 17, 168-9; effect of change in 49-50; in observed factories 20; legitimacy's effect on 37; uneven 65-6
Baldamus, W. 18, 74, 113, 114
bargaining *see* negotiations
bargaining awareness 48, 96
Batstone, E. 14, 15, 35, 40, 87
behavioural processes 14
Behrend, H. 114
Bendix, R. 41, 70-82, 129
Berger, P. 47
Beynon, H. 14, 19
Bittner, E. 14, 54, 141, 146
Blau, P. 33
bonus schemes 23, 24, 77, 89; division of 139, 172-3; renegotiating 155-8, 177-80, 208; unofficial 131
Boraston, I. 14, 30
briefing groups 24
Brown, R.K. 14
Brown, W.A. 14, 33, 34, 42, 48, 64, 96, 100, 141, 175
Bulmer, M. 14
buy-out 124, 169

capitalism 82
cleaning time 182-3
Clegg, H.A. 159
Cliff, T. 39
closed shop 20, 26, 151
closure 180-1; theats of 79, 199
common sense 54, 162-5
communications systems 24
comparison, language of 95
competence, managerial 40, 71, 73-4; workers' response to claims of 75-6, 90-1
compliance 19
concessions 152
conflict perspective 211
consciousness 14; class 42-3; false 39, 83; workers' dualistic 19
consensual principles 95-107, 125
consistency, principle of 42, 95-6, 112, 136; written rules and 152
consultative committees 24, 26
contract of employment 64, 200; freedom of 71-2; ideology of 65-6; regulation of 66
contract work 179
control system, managerial 18-20; perceived legitimacy of 18
cost-of-living increases 134-5
cost reduction 181
craftsmen 112; differentials 155-6
Cunnison, S. 14
custom and practice 13, 33, 34, 42, 141; as a rallying cry 53; basis for resistance 43; management's dislike of 159-60; managerial recognition of 97; persistence of 175; rules and 86-7; used by management 170-71

Daniel, W.W. 14
day-work 174
delegated property rights 72-3
demarcation 53-4
differentials 154-5, 161; supervisory 92-3, 170-71
dirt money 116, 169-70, 173, 194
disciplinary measures 16, 65, 66-7, 187-212 *passim*; tactics of 113
dismissal, power of 65, 70
dominant ideology: language and 160, 165; managerial ideology as

41, 42-3, 56, 83; workers' resistance to 88, 112
domination of labour 19
Donovan Report (Royal Commission on Trade Unions and Employers' Associations) 13
Dunlop, J.T. 33-4

efficiency 53, 68, 210; higher wages and 91-2; profit and 69
effort-reward bargain 60, 102, 103-16; maintenance of 123, 128, 136, 204-7; product changes and 81; renegotiating 16
Electrical, Electronic Telecommunication and Plumbing Union (EETPU) 21, 22
emotional reactions 160-61
employers' associations 20, 24
employers' property rights 40, 173
employment relationship 17-20; dynamism of 17
equity 100-1
ethical standards 106-7
external agreement 13, 150-4; limited effect of 50; rule changes and 49-50

factories (observed in study) 20-7
factory-based observation 14
fairness 15, 46, 76-7, 101-3, 112, 172-3, 189; different uses of 125; interpretation of 125
fall-back pay 201
false consciousness 39, 83
Fatchet, D. 34
Flanders, A. 32, 150
foreman 18, 93
formal rules 14, 18, 140-5; as legitimising principles 54-5; conformity to 145-6; defined 33, 54-5; distinguished from real 55; hierarchy and 149-50; legitimacy of 149-52; power and 152-4; *see also* written regulations
Fox, A. 14, 35, 39, 40, 150
frontier of control 14, 43; shifted by workers 39

Gellner, E. 78
General and Municipal Workers Union 24
gentleman's agreement 72, 101
Gerth, H. 36
Giddens, A. 40
Gill, J. 34
Goldthorpe, J.H. 14, 32, 40, 41, 88
Goodman, J. 34
Goodrich, C.L. 14
Gouldner, A. 149
'grabbers' 142-4
grading disputes 16
greivance: defining 35; procedure 26

habits: rules and 86-7
health and safety 16, 105, 130, 151-2, 171, 174; arguments used by workers 186; committee 24, 210
Herding, R. 39
hierarchical prerogative 93, 112
holidays 120-1, 126-8
hours of work 62
humanitarian standards 106-7
Hyman, R. 14, 32, 41, 76, 101-2

ideology 15, 56; exchanges based on 47; legitimising principles and 37, 187-212; management rules and 70-82; rehearsals of 47; terminology and 53; workers' 43, 45-6; *see also* dominant ideology *and* managerial ideology
incremental change 17
indulgency pattern 149
industrial action: at Pennine 129
industrial relations: defined 32; rules as output from 33-4
industrial sociology 13
informal rules 14, 130-2, 140; justifying 34
information 74-5, 96; on regulations 109, 149; withholding of 110
informers 161-2, 178
interests 15, 39
internalism 18-19
investment decisions 59

'job and finish' system 131
job descriptions 110, 111, 149
job evaluation scheme 22
job property rights 116-18, 159-60, 174, 205, 210; used by management 123-4
justificatory principles 87-8, 95-107; repertoire of 16

Kahn Freund, O. 65

labour force *see* workers
labour market 17; workers' power position and 50
Lancashire Electrical Fittings (LEF) 23-5
language 53, 159-62, 165
lateness, creeping 87
law, the 64-6, 105; ignored by both sides 151-2; legitimacy and 65, 143; threat of recourse to 153
legitimisation 15, 39-44; as constraint on choice of issue 36; at public level 37, 183; available principles for 44; bargaining and 130-6; changes in 173-7; contested 44-9, 120-39; convincing other side 45; criteria for 176; custom as 87; formality as 140-1; ideology and 187-212; language and 159-62; law as 65; modes of 140-66; rule making and 35-6, 167-86; structure of 167-73; subordinate to power 15
legitimising principles 36-7; application of 168-72; available to workers 51; consonant with other side 123; explicit and implicit 154-9; formal rules as 54; forms of 53-5; in equilibrium with rules 167; lack of 52; new application of existing 51; rule changes and 46-7
Lenski, G. 93
Lerner, S.W. 14
lieu days 126, 128
living costs 47
lunch hour 103-4, 177; working through 142
Lupton, T. 14

McCarthy, W. 14, 35, 95
machine breakdown 176
Mackay, D.I. 14
management: as employers 72-3; as subordinate employees 73; changes in personnel 22, 23, 51; conflict within 196; controls on 79-80; cultural origins of 46, 70; errors 120-1, 175, 179; expertise 75; incompetence 90-1; initiatives 122, 202; labour law and 17; legitimisation for 39-44; performance 121; piecework earnings and 142-4; power 40, 42; right to manage 17-18; senior control of lower 161-2
management rules and rule-making 34, 39-44, 59-85; by junior managers 93; fairness and 101-3; ideology and 70-82; legitimacy of 64-70; unfettered 168; unilateral 61, 62, 67-8; wide scope of 63-4; workers' acquiescence in 82-4
management structure: at LEF 23-4; at MoFoL 25-6; at Pennine 22
managerial ideology 95, 45-6, 70; accepted by workers 82, 167-8; in the dominant ideology 41, 42; resistance to 125-9 *passim*; used by workers 89-95
managerial prerogative 43, 51, 53, 56, 127; compromise and 46; exercise of 67-8; formal rules and 55; ideology of 70-82; lack of specificity of 113; legitimacy and 167-8; mobilisation around 45; resistance to 66; weakened 197
Mann, M. 14
manning levels 16; reducing 50, 184-5, 202, 207-8
Margerison, C.J. 32
marketing decisions 39-40
measured daywork: at LEF 24-5, 97-8; methodology 27-9; regrading 102-3, 133; timings 108; unmeasured work 25
mobilisation 37; of bias 44-5, 87; of workers' power 122-3
moral perspectives 15, 131-2, 143, 147, 148
Moulded Footwear Ltd (MoFoL) 25-7
mutuality clause 108

national agreements 49-50, 150-1; observance of 153-4
National Board for Prices and Incomes 14
National Union of Footwear, Leather and Allied Trades (NUFLAT) 26
negotiated order 49; temporary

41, 42-3, 56, 83; workers' resistance to 88, 112
domination of labour 19
Donovan Report (Royal Commission on Trade Unions and Employers' Associations) 13
Dunlop, J.T. 33-4

efficiency 53, 68, 210; higher wages and 91-2; profit and 69
effort-reward bargain 60, 102, 103-16; maintenance of 123, 128, 136, 204-7; product changes and 81; renegotiating 16
Electrical, Electronic Telecommunication and Plumbing Union (EETPU) 21, 22
emotional reactions 160-61
employers' associations 20, 24
employers' property rights 40, 173
employment relationship 17-20; dynamism of 17
equity 100-1
ethical standards 106-7
external agreement 13, 150-4; limited effect of 50; rule changes and 49-50

factories (observed in study) 20-7
factory-based observation 14
fairness 15, 46, 76-7, 101-3, 112, 172-3, 189; different uses of 125; interpretation of 125
fall-back pay 201
false consciousness 39, 83
Fatchet, D. 34
Flanders, A. 32, 150
foreman 18, 93
formal rules 14, 18, 140-5; as legitimising principles 54-5; conformity to 145-6; defined 33, 54-5; distinguished from real 55; hierarchy and 149-50; legitimacy of 149-52; power and 152-4; *see also* written regulations
Fox, A. 14, 35, 39, 40, 150
frontier of control 14, 43; shifted by workers 39

Gellner, E. 78
General and Municipal Workers Union 24
gentleman's agreement 72, 101
Gerth, H. 36
Giddens, A. 40
Gill, J. 34
Goldthorpe, J.H. 14, 32, 40, 41, 88
Goodman, J. 34
Goodrich, C.L. 14
Gouldner, A. 149
'grabbers' 142-4
grading disputes 16
greivance: defining 35; procedure 26

habits: rules and 86-7
health and safety 16, 105, 130, 151-2, 171, 174; arguments used by workers 186; committee 24, 210
Herding, R. 39
hierarchical prerogative 93, 112
holidays 120-1, 126-8
hours of work 62
humanitarian standards 106-7
Hyman, R. 14, 32, 41, 76, 101-2

ideology 15, 56; exchanges based on 47; legitimising principles and 37, 187-212; management rules and 70-82; rehearsals of 47; terminology and 53; workers' 43, 45-6; *see also* dominant ideology *and* managerial ideology
incremental change 17
indulgency pattern 149
industrial action: at Pennine 129
industrial relations: defined 32; rules as output from 33-4
industrial sociology 13
informal rules 14, 130-2, 140; justifying 34
information 74-5, 96; on regulations 109, 149; withholding of 110
informers 161-2, 178
interests 15, 39
internalism 18-19
investment decisions 59

'job and finish' system 131
job descriptions 110, 111, 149
job evaluation scheme 22
job property rights 116-18, 159-60, 174, 205, 210; used by management 123-4
justificatory principles 87-8, 95-107; repertoire of 16

Kahn Freund, O. 65

labour force *see* workers
labour market 17; workers' power position and 50
Lancashire Electrical Fittings (LEF) 23-5
language 53, 159-62, 165
lateness, creeping 87
law, the 64-6, 105; ignored by both sides 151-2; legitimacy and 65, 143; threat of recourse to 153
legitimisation 15, 39-44; as constraint on choice of issue 36; at public level 37, 183; available principles for 44; bargaining and 130-6; changes in 173-7; contested 44-9, 120-39; convincing other side 45; criteria for 176; custom as 87; formality as 140-1; ideology and 187-212; language and 159-62; law as 65; modes of 140-66; rule making and 35-6, 167-86; structure of 167-73; subordinate to power 15
legitimising principles 36-7; application of 168-72; available to workers 51; consonant with other side 123; explicit and implicit 154-9; formal rules as 54; forms of 53-5; in equilibrium with rules 167; lack of 52; new application of existing 51; rule changes and 46-7
Lenski, G. 93
Lerner, S.W. 14
lieu days 126, 128
living costs 47
lunch hour 103-4, 177; working through 142
Lupton, T. 14

McCarthy, W. 14, 35, 95
machine breakdown 176
Mackay, D.I. 14
management: as employers 72-3; as subordinate employees 73; changes in personnel 22, 23, 51; conflict within 196; controls on 79-80; cultural origins of 46, 70; errors 120-1, 175, 179; expertise 75; incompetence 90-1; initiatives 122, 202; labour law and 17; legitimisation for 39-44; performance 121; piecework earnings and 142-4; power 40, 42; right to manage 17-18; senior control of lower 161-2
management rules and rule-making 34, 39-44, 59-85; by junior managers 93; fairness and 101-3; ideology and 70-82; legitimacy of 64-70; unfettered 168; unilateral 61, 62, 67-8; wide scope of 63-4; workers' acquiescence in 82-4
management structure: at LEF 23-4; at MoFoL 25-6; at Pennine 22
managerial ideology 95, 45-6, 70; accepted by workers 82, 167-8; in the dominant ideology 41, 42; resistance to 125-9 *passim*; used by workers 89-95
managerial prerogative 43, 51, 53, 56, 127; compromise and 46; exercise of 67-8; formal rules and 55; ideology of 70-82; lack of specificity of 113; legitimacy and 167-8; mobilisation around 45; resistance to 66; weakened 197
Mann, M. 14
manning levels 16; reducing 50, 184-5, 202, 207-8
Margerison, C.J. 32
marketing decisions 39-40
measured daywork: at LEF 24-5, 97-8; methodology 27-9; regrading 102-3, 133; timings 108; unmeasured work 25
mobilisation 37; of bias 44-5, 87; of workers' power 122-3
moral perspectives 15, 131-2, 143, 147, 148
Moulded Footwear Ltd (MoFoL) 25-7
mutuality clause 108

national agreements 49-50, 150-1; observance of 153-4
National Board for Prices and Incomes 14
National Union of Footwear, Leather and Allied Trades (NUFLAT) 26
negotiated order 49; temporary

nature of 19
negotiating climate 47
negotiations: debt and credit in 137-9; parameters of 40; pay, 51; trade offs in 134-5; *see also* wage bargaining
Nichols, T. 82, 88

observation methods 27-8
order, contingent nature of 14
organised behaviour 13
orientations, workers' 14
output levels 16
overtime premiums 22
ownership 64, 72-3

Parkin, F. 14, 41, 43, 83, 94-5
Partridge, B.E. 14, 35
payment systems: at Pennine 22; control of 59; externally negotiated 175-6; *see also* specific systems
Paterson, T.T. 14
Pennine Plastic Materials 21-3
personnel management: at LEF 23-4; at MoFoL 26
Phelps Brown, E.H. 36
piecework 26-7, 80, 99-100; average earnings 147; effect of technological change on 60; elimination of 63; job property rights and 118; negotiations 121-2, 174; rate changes 68, 83, 99-100, 141-3, 171-2, 189
power 15; arbitrary, managerial 40, 42; ends of 15; formal rules and 152-4; inequality of 16; legitimisation of 167; limits to 38-9; mobilising 15-16; newly available 50; rules imposed by 34; threats of 48, 129-30, 152-3, 158; *see also* authority *and* balance of power
precedent 27, 96-101
premium payment 130
product innovation 40
production 69; changes 16; quality 80-81, 198, 206-7; technology 18; underused 22-3
productivity: appeals to 41; disputes 60
product market 17, 18, 24; changes 49-50; in observed factories 20; international competition and 21, 25, 68, 77, 179; price cutting and 50; workers' awareness of problems in 23
profit and profitability 19, 69-70; aims related to 40-41; ambiguity of 78; at LEF 23; at Pennine 22; ideology of 82-3; legitimisation from 41-2, 43, 47, 51, 68, 77-82, 167; mobilisation around 45; primacy of 69
propaganda 178, 180

rationality, managerial 161
redeployment 16, 59, 61, 116-18; at lower rates 123-4, 176; considered managerial prerogative 120
redundancy 16, 153; at Pennine 22; in observed factories 20; justifying 45; last in first out 123; negotiations for 40
relevance 103-6
re-location, factory 21, 23, 121
restrictive practice 53-4, 159
Robinson, D. 14
Roethlisberger, F.J. 33
rules and rule-making 27, 32; accepted with employment 72; adjusted for legitimisation 15; arguments to support 35; as *fait accompli* 53; as output of an industrial relations system 33-4; beneficial to profitability 45; challenge to 173; changes 177-86; conflict theory of 38; conflict with other managerial rules 34; considered unjust 48; continuing argument over 38; defined 32-3; dialectic of 167-86; dummy run 182-3; exchange and 48-9; extra system 34, 150; flexible 110-11; impermanence of 19; imposed by power 34; initiation of change 52; injustice and 35; interpretation of 52, 55, 110, 146-8, 191; justifying 44; lack of distinction between formal and informal 35; legitimacy of, unaccepted 129; legitimisation and 167-86; licensed users of 146-7; methods of administration 107; new rules leading to further rules 51-2; normal mode of 64; one-off changes in 169; public aspects of 37-8; reworking of 176-7;

unilateral 37, 39, 70; valuation of 49; values and 16; varieties of change in 49-53; workers' resistance to 43; *see also* formal rules, informal rules *and* management rules

safety *see* health and safety
sales 68-9
sanctions 129-30; formal rules and 152-4
semi-skilled status 154-5
shift premiums 22
shift work 174
shop stewards 14, 24, 26, 33; full-time officials and 154; grievances defined by 35; legitimisation and 36-7, 46
short cut work methods 87
short time working 63, 164-5, 175
sick pay 178
Silverman, D. 14, 141
social behaviour 19
societal imagery 14, 42, 88
status crystallisation 93-4
statutory incomes policy
Storey, J. 14, 39, 42, 88, 94
Strauss, A. 14, 49
strikes 22, 26
survival, company 69, 126-7, 181

tea-break 103-4, 205-6; working through 142-3
team perspective 211
technical expertise 74, 90-91
technological change 39, 59-61; new rules arising from 39-40, 49-50
terminology 53, 159-62, 165
timekeeping 16
time sheets 188-201 *passim*
trade unions 21-2; full-time officers 94, 150-51, 154, 199; recognition of 20, 21; white collar 20
transfer rates 147
Transport and General Workers Union (TGWU) 21, 22

unmeasured work 25, 169

values and value systems 15; appeals to 15; applied to rules 16; differing 16; group 47; subordinate 91-5; working class 94
vocabulary of motives 36-7

wage bargaining 66; buying out rules during 133-5; workplace 14
wages: incremental changes in 17; rates 144-5; unilateral control of 63
waiting time 111, 116, 136, 144, 147, 164, 188, 210; senior management's use of 161-2
walkouts 187-97
Walton, R.E. 35, 47
warning, written 150
Warren, A. 14
washing-up time 116, 183-4
Weber, M. 140
Westergaard, J.H. 14, 42, 88, 112
work: content 61-2; groups 13-14; measurement 115; pace of 62; shortage 61, 62-3
worker transfers *see* redeployment
workers: composition of 21, 24, 25; law and control of 17; legitimisation for 39-44; solidarity 194; turnover 22, 25; variations in views of 45, 112-13
workers' job regulation 33
workers' resistance 86-119; to dominant ideology 88; to managerial ideology 89-91
workplace, analysis of 13
workplace relationships 14
'wreckers' 127, 128
written regulations 32-3, 107-12; absurd consequences of 165; industry wide 109, 110-11; invoking 148-9; non-enforcement of, in bargaining 149; *see also* formal rules

Zimmerman, D. 14, 54, 141, 146

College of Industrial
Relations.
STUDENTS' LIBRARY.

CONTENTS

List of Abbreviations
Preface and Acknowledgements
1. Introduction, Background and Methods
2. Theoretical Considerations
3. Management Rules and their Legitimisation
4. Workers' Resistance and Initiatives
5. Contested Legitimacy
6. Modes of Legitimisation
7. The Dialectic of Rules and Legitimisation
8. Ideology and Legitimisation in Action
Index

ISBN 0-7099-0465-7