





BOOKS TO BE RETURNED BY:-

3 DEC 1984	14 NOV 1988	8 MAY 1992
5 NOV 1984	3 APR 1989	30 NOV 1992
26 NOV 1985	25 APR 1989	24 JAN 1997
23 OCT 1986		17 NOV 1993
25 FEB 1987	7 FEB 1990	
31 MAR 1987		
21 APR 1987		
27 MAY 1987	7 NOV 1990	
9 OCT 1987	8 MAY 1991	
26 OCT 1987	4 NOV 1991	
11 JAN 1988		
25 OCT 1988		
	22 FEB 1994	
	22 MAR 1994	
	10 APR 1995	
	27 JAN 1997	

A. Bowman & Company Ltd

College of Industrial
Relations.
STUDENTS' LIBRARY.

Ideology and Shop-floor Industrial Relations

P.J. Armstrong, J.E.B. Goodman and J.D. Hyman

College of Industrial
85/489 Relations. Rec. No.
978
STUDENTS' LIBRARY.



CROOM HELM LONDON

© 1981 P.J. Armstrong, J.F.B. Goodman and J.D. Hyman
Croom Helm Ltd, 2-10 St. John's Road, London SW11

British Library Cataloguing in Publication Data

Armstrong, P J
Ideology and shop-floor industrial
relations.
I. Industrial relations — Great Britain —
Case Studies
I. Title II. Goodman, J F B
III. Hyman, J D
331'.0941 HD8391

ISBN 0-7099-0465-7

Printed in Great Britain by
Biddles Ltd, Guildford, Surrey

CONTENTS

List of Abbreviations

Preface and Acknowledgements

1. Introduction, Background and Methods	13
2. Theoretical Considerations	32
3. Management Rules and their Legitimation	59
4. Workers' Resistance and Initiatives	86
5. Contested Legitimacy	120
6. Modes of Legitimation	140
7. The Dialectic of Rules and Legitimation	167
8. Ideology and Legitimation in Action	187
Index	213

ABBREVIATIONS

ACAS	Advisory Conciliation and Arbitration Service
ASTMS	Association of Supervisory Technical and Managerial Staffs
AUEW	Amalgamated Union of Engineering Workers
C & P	custom and practice
EEPTU	Electrical, Electronic, Telecommunication and Plumbing Union
GMWU	General and Municipal Workers' Union
MDW	measured day work
NUFLAT	National Union of Footwear, Leather and Allied Trades
TGWU	Transport and General Workers' Union
The Firms:	
LEF	Lancashire Electrical Fittings
MoFoL	Moulded Footwear Limited
Pennine	Pennine Plastic Materials

PREFACE AND ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

This book originated in an interest in 'custom and practice' (C & P) as both a source and a form of workplace industrial relations rules. Our initial intention was to explore this concept through in-depth observational studies in three factories. As our research progressed, however, it became clear that this formed a somewhat limited element of the legitimising arguments found in the interplay between workers and managers in the three factories, and consequently the scope of the research was broadened into a fuller examination of workers' and managers' notions of legitimacy which seemed to us to be central to the process of workplace rule making. C & P was only one element of this, and by no means the dominant one.

We are indebted to many people. First, and perhaps most of all, to the men and women, workers and managers, in the factories for allowing us to observe them at work, and for spending time so generously to talk about their work. Secondly we must acknowledge the financial assistance of the Social Science Research Council, without which the research could not have been conducted. Finally, and by no means least, we also record our thanks to Margaret Lees and Christine Williams who shared the task of typing the manuscript and co-ordinated the flow of paper with great good humour and unsurpassable efficiency.

Peter Armstrong
John Goodman
Jeffrey Hyman

University of Manchester Institute of
Science and Technology

INDEX

- absence 16, 185
- Advisory Conciliation and Arbitration Service (ACAS) 24
- Amalgamated Union of Engineering Workers (AUEW) 21, 22, 24
- arbitration 154
- Armstrong, P.J. 34, 88
- Association of Scientific, Technical and Managerial Staff (ASTMS) 22, 24, 26
- attitudinal structuring 35, 47, 178-9
- authority: distinguished from power 40, 41, 84; distribution of managerial 67, 193
- average earnings calculation 147
- Bain, G.S. 32
- balance of power 55-6; apathy and 63; changes in 17, 168-9; effect of change in 49-50; in observed factories 20; legitimacy's effect on 37; uneven 65-6
- Baldamus, W. 18, 74, 113, 114
- bargaining *see* negotiations
- bargaining awareness 48, 96
- Batstone, E. 14, 15, 35, 40, 87
- behavioural processes 14
- Behrend, H. 114
- Bendix, R. 41, 70-82, 129
- Berger, P. 47
- Beynon, H. 14, 19
- Bittner, E. 14, 54, 141, 146
- Blau, P. 33
- bonus schemes 23, 24, 77, 89; division of 139, 172-3; renegotiating 155-8, 177-80, 208; unofficial 131
- Boraston, I. 14, 30
- briefing groups 24
- Brown, R.K. 14
- Brown, W.A. 14, 33, 34, 42, 48, 64, 96, 100, 141, 175
- Bulmer, M. 14
- buy-out 124, 169
- capitalism 82
- cleaning time 182-3
- Clegg, H.A. 159
- Cliff, T. 39
- closed shop 20, 26, 151
- closure 180-1; threats of 79, 199
- common sense 54, 162-5
- communications systems 24
- comparison, language of 95
- competence, managerial 40, 71, 73-4; workers' response to claims of 75-6, 90-1
- compliance 19
- concessions 152
- conflict perspective 211
- consciousness 14; class 42-3; false 39, 83; workers' dualistic 19
- consensual principles 95-107, 125
- consistency, principle of 42, 95-6, 112, 136; written rules and 152
- consultative committees 24, 26
- contract of employment 64, 200; freedom of 71-2; ideology of 65-6; regulation of 66
- contract work 179
- control system, managerial 18-20; perceived legitimacy of 18
- cost-of-living increases 134-5
- cost reduction 181
- craftsmen 112; differentials 155-6
- Cunnison, S. 14
- custom and practice 13, 33, 34, 42, 141; as a rallying cry 53; basis for resistance 43; management's dislike of 159-60; managerial recognition of 97; persistence of 175; rules and 86-7; used by management 170-71
- Daniel, W.W. 14
- day-work 174
- delegated property rights 72-3
- demarcation 53-4
- differentials 154-5, 161; supervisory 92-3, 170-71
- dirt money 116, 169-70, 173, 194
- disciplinary measures 16, 65, 66-7, 187-212 *passim*; tactics of 113
- dismissal, power of 65, 70
- dominant ideology: language and 160, 165; managerial ideology as

- 41, 42-3, 56, 83; workers' resistance to 88, 112
 domination of labour 19
 Donovan Report (Royal Commission on Trade Unions and Employers' Associations) 13
 Dunlop, J.T. 33-4
- efficiency 53, 68, 210; higher wages and 91-2; profit and 69
 effort-reward bargain 60, 102, 103-16;
 maintenance of 123, 128, 136, 204-7;
 product changes and 81; renegotiating 16
 Electrical, Electronic Telecommunication and Plumbing Union (EETPU) 21, 22
 emotional reactions 160-61
 employers' associations 20, 24
 employers' property rights 40, 173
 employment relationship 17-20;
 dynamism of 17
 equity 100-1
 ethical standards 106-7
 external agreement 13, 150-4;
 limited effect of 50; rule changes and 49-50
- factories (observed in study) 20-7
 factory-based observation 14
 fairness 15, 46, 76-7, 101-3, 112, 172-3, 189; different uses of 125; interpretation of 125
 fall-back pay 201
 false consciousness 39, 83
 Fatchet, D. 34
 Flanders, A. 32, 150
 foreman 18, 93
 formal rules 14, 18, 140-5; as legitimising principles 54-5; conformity to 145-6; defined 33, 54-5; distinguished from real 55; hierarchy and 149-50; legitimacy of 149-52; power and 152-4; *see also* written regulations
 Fox, A. 14, 35, 39, 40, 150
 frontier of control 14, 43; shifted by workers 39
- Gellner, E. 78
 General and Municipal Workers Union 24
 gentleman's agreement 72, 101
- Gerth, H. 36
 Giddens, A. 40
 Gill, J. 34
 Goldthorpe, J.H. 14, 32, 40, 41, 88
 Goodman, J. 34
 Goodrich, C.L. 14
 Gouldner, A. 149
 'grabbers' 142-4
 grading disputes 16
 grievance: defining 35; procedure 26
- habits: rules and 86-7
 health and safety 16, 105, 130, 151-2, 171, 174; arguments used by workers 186; committee 24, 210
 Herding, R. 39
 hierarchical prerogative 93, 112
 holidays 120-1, 126-8
 hours of work 62
 humanitarian standards 106-7
 Hyman, R. 14, 32, 41, 76, 101-2
- ideology 15, 56; exchanges based on 47; legitimising principles and 37, 187-212; management rules and 70-82; rehearsals of 47; terminology and 53; workers' 43, 45-6; *see also* dominant ideology and managerial ideology
 incremental change 17
 indulgency pattern 149
 industrial action: at Pennine 129
 industrial relations: defined 32; rules as output from 33-4
 industrial sociology 13
 informal rules 14, 130-2, 140; justifying 34
 information 74-5, 96; on regulations 109, 149; withholding of 110
 informers 161-2, 178
 interests 15, 39
 internalism 18-19
 investment decisions 59
- 'job and finish' system 131
 job descriptions 110, 111, 149
 job evaluation scheme 22
 job property rights 116-18, 159-60, 174, 205, 210; used by management 123-4
 justificatory principles 87-8, 95-107; repertoire of 16
- Kahn Freund, O. 65

- labour force *see* workers
 labour market 17; workers' power position and 50
 Lancashire Electrical Fittings (LEF) 23-5
 language 53, 159-62, 165
 lateness, creeping 87
 law, the 64-6, 105; ignored by both sides 151-2; legitimacy and 65, 143; threat of recourse to 153
 legitimisation 15, 39-44; as constraint on choice of issue 36; at public level 37, 183; available principles for 44; bargaining and 130-6; changes in 173-7; contested 44-9, 120-39; convincing other side 45; criteria for 176; custom as 87; formality as 140-1; ideology and 187-212; language and 159-62; law as 65; modes of 140-66; rule making and 35-6, 167-86; structure of 167-73; subordinate to power 15
 legitimising principles 36-7; application of 168-72; available to workers 51; consonant with other side 123; explicit and implicit 154-9; formal rules as 54; forms of 53-5; in equilibrium with rules 167; lack of 52; new application of existing 51; rule changes and 46-7
- Lenski, G. 93
 Lerner, S.W. 14
 lieu days 126, 128
 living costs 47
 lunch hour 103-4, 177; working through 142
 Lupton, T. 14
- McCarthy, W. 14, 35, 95
 machine breakdown 176
 Mackay, D.I. 14
 management: as employers 72-3; as subordinate employees 73; changes in personnel 22, 23, 51; conflict within 196; controls on 79-80; cultural origins of 46, 70; errors 120-1, 175, 179; expertise 75; incompetence 90-1; initiatives 122, 202; labour law and 17; legitimisation for 39-44;
- performance 121; piecework earnings and 142-4; power 40, 42; right to manage 17-18; senior control of lower 161-2
 management rules and rule-making 34, 39-44, 59-85; by junior managers 93; fairness and 101-3; ideology and 70-82; legitimacy of 64-70; unfettered 168; unilateral 61, 62, 67-8; wide scope of 63-4; workers' acquiescence in 82-4
 management structure: at LEF 23-4; at MoFoL 25-6; at Pennine 22
 managerial ideology 95, 45-6, 70; accepted by workers 82, 167-8; in the dominant ideology 41, 42; resistance to 125-9 *passim*; used by workers 89-95
 managerial prerogative 43, 51, 53, 56, 127; compromise and 46; exercise of 67-8; formal rules and 55; ideology of 70-82; lack of specificity of 113; legitimacy and 167-8; mobilisation around 45; resistance to 66; weakened 197
 Mann, M. 14
 manning levels 16; reducing 50, 184-5, 202, 207-8
 Margerison, C.J. 32
 marketing decisions 39-40
 measured daywork: at LEF 24-5, 97-8; methodology 27-9; regrading 102-3, 133; timings 108; unmeasured work 25
 mobilisation 37; of bias 44-5, 87; of workers' power 122-3
 moral perspectives 15, 131-2, 143, 147, 148
 Moulded Footwear Ltd (MoFoL) 25-7
 mutuality clause 108
- national agreements 49-50, 150-1; observance of 153-4
 National Board for Prices and Incomes 14
 National Union of Footwear, Leather and Allied Trades (NUFLAT) 26
 negotiated order 49; temporary

nature of 19
 negotiating climate 47
 negotiations: debt and credit in 137-9;
 parameters of 40; pay, 51;
 trade offs in 134-5; *see also* wage
 bargaining
 Nichols, T. 82, 88

 observation methods 27-8
 order, contingent nature of 14
 organised behaviour 13
 orientations, workers' 14
 output levels 16
 overtime premiums 22
 ownership 64, 72-3

 Parkin, F. 14, 41, 43, 83, 94-5
 Partridge, B.E. 14, 35
 payment systems: at Pennine 22;
 control of 59; externally
 negotiated 175-6; *see also*
 specific systems
 Paterson, T.T. 14
 Pennine Plastic Materials 21-3
 personnel management: at LEF
 23-4; at MoFoL 26
 Phelps Brown, E.H. 36
 piecework 26-7, 80, 99-100; average
 earnings 147; effect of technological
 change on 60; elimination of 63;
 job property rights and 118;
 negotiations 121-2, 174; rate
 changes 68, 83, 99-100, 141-3,
 171-2, 189
 power 15; arbitrary, managerial
 40, 42; ends of 15; formal rules
 and 152-4; inequality of 16;
 legitimisation of 167; limits
 to 38-9; mobilising 15-16; newly
 available 50; rules imposed by
 34; threats of 48, 129-30, 152-3,
 158; *see also* authority and
 balance of power
 precedent 27, 96-101
 premium payment 130
 product innovation 40
 production 69; changes 16; quality
 80-81, 198, 206-7; technology
 18; underused 22-3
 productivity: appeals to 41;
 disputes 60
 product market 17, 18, 24;
 changes 49-50; in observed
 factories 20; international
 competition and 21, 25, 68, 77,

179; price cutting and 50;
 workers' awareness of problems
 in 23
 profit and profitability 19, 69-70;
 aims related to 40-41; ambiguity
 of 78; at LEF 23; at Pennine
 22; ideology of 82-3; legitimisa-
 tion from 41-2, 43, 47, 51, 68,
 77-82, 167; mobilisation
 around 45; primacy of 69
 propaganda 178, 180

 rationality, managerial 161
 redeployment 16, 59, 61, 116-18;
 at lower rates 123-4, 176;
 considered managerial prerogative
 120
 redundancy 16, 153; at Pennine 22;
 in observed factories 20; justifying
 45; last in first out 123; negotia-
 tions for 40
 relevance 103-6
 re-location, factory 21, 23, 121
 restrictive practice 53-4, 159
 Robinson, D. 14
 Roethlisberger, F.J. 33
 rules and rule-making 27, 32;
 accepted with employment 72;
 adjusted for legitimisation 15;
 arguments to support 35; as *fait*
 accompli 53; as output of an
 industrial relations system 33-4;
 beneficial to profitability 45;
 challenge to 173; changes 177-86;
 conflict theory of 38; conflict
 with other managerial rules 34;
 considered unjust 48; continuing
 argument over 38; defined 32-3;
 dialectic of 167-86; dummy run
 182-3; exchange and 48-9; extra
 system 34, 150; flexible 110-11;
 impermanence of 19; imposed by
 power 34; initiation of change
 52; injustice and 35; interpreta-
 tion of 52, 55, 110, 146-8, 191;
 justifying 44; lack of distinction
 between formal and informal 35;
 legitimacy of, unaccepted 129;
 legitimisation and 167-86; licensed
 users of 146-7; methods of
 administration 107; new rules
 leading to further rules 51-2;
 normal mode of 64; one-off
 changes in 169; public aspects of
 37-8; reworking of 176-7;

unilateral 37, 39, 70; valuation
 of 49; values and 16; varieties of
 change in 49-53; workers'
 resistance to 43; *see also* formal
 rules, informal rules and
 management rules

 safety *see* health and safety
 sales 68-9
 sanctions 129-30; formal rules and
 152-4
 semi-skilled status 154-5
 shift premiums 22
 shift work 174
 shop stewards 14, 24, 26, 33;
 full-time officials and 154;
 grievances defined by 35;
 legitimisation and 36-7, 46
 short cut work methods 87
 short time working 63, 164-5, 175
 sick pay 178
 Silverman, D. 14, 141
 social behaviour 19
 societal imagery 14, 42, 88
 status crystallisation 93-4
 statutory incomes policy
 Storey, J. 14, 39, 42, 88, 94
 Strauss, A. 14, 49
 strikes 22, 26
 survival, company 69, 126-7, 181

 tea-break 103-4, 205-6; working
 through 142-3
 team perspective 211
 technical expertise 74, 90-91
 technological change 39,
 59-61; new rules arising from
 39-40, 49-50
 terminology 53, 159-62, 165
 timekeeping 16
 time sheets 188-201 *passim*
 trade unions 21-2; full-time
 officers 94, 150-51, 154, 199;
 recognition of 20, 21; white
 collar 20
 transfer rates 147
 Transport and General Workers
 Union (TGWU) 21, 22

 unmeasured work 25, 169

 values and value systems 15;
 appeals to 15; applied to rules
 16; differing 16; group 47;

subordinate 91-5; working class
 94
 vocabulary of motives 36-7

 wage bargaining 66; buying out
 rules during 133-5; workplace 14
 wages: incremental changes in 17;
 rates 144-5; unilateral control of
 63
 waiting time 111, 116, 136, 144,
 147, 164, 188, 210; senior
 management's use of 161-2
 walkouts 187-97
 Walton, R.E. 35, 47
 warning, written 150
 Warren, A. 14
 washing-up time 116, 183-4
 Weber, M. 140
 Westergaard, J.H. 14, 42, 88, 112
 work: content 61-2; groups 13-14;
 measurement 115; pace of 62;
 shortage 61, 62-3
 worker transfers *see* redeployment
 workers: composition of 21, 24, 25;
 law and control of 17; legitimisa-
 tion for 39-44; solidarity 194;
 turnover 22, 25; variations in
 views of 45, 112-13
 workers' job regulation 33
 workers' resistance 86-119; to
 dominant ideology 88; to
 managerial ideology 89-91
 workplace, analysis of 13
 workplace relationships 14
 'wreckers' 127, 128
 written regulations 32-3, 107-12;
 absurd consequences of 165;
 industry wide 109, 110-11;
 invoking 148-9; non-enforce-
 ment of, in bargaining 149;
 see also formal rules

 Zimmerman, D. 14, 54, 141, 146

