INDUSTRIAL RELATIONS THEORY

Its Nature, Scope, and Pedagogy

NCI Library
3 9006 01042894 6

LIBRARY

LIBRARY

INSTITUTE OF MANAGEMENT AND LABOR RELATIONS SERIES—RUTGERS, THE STATE UNIVERSITY OF NEW JERSEY

Editor: James Chelius

1. *Reflections on the Transformation of Industrial Relations*, edited by James Chelius and James Dworkin. 1990

2. *Profit Sharing and Gain Sharing*, edited by Myron J. Roomkin. 1990

3. *The Mediator Revisited: Profile of a Profession, 1960s and 1985*, by Ruth F. Necheles-Jansyn. 1990

4. *Industrial Relations Theory*, edited by Roy J. Adams and Noah M. Meltz. 1993

Record No: 15705
Dewey No: 331
Date Input: 27/6/96
£40

Industrial Relations Theory

Its Nature, Scope, and Pedagogy

edited by

Roy J. Adams and Noah M. Meltz

Institute of Management and Labor Relations Series, No. 4



IMLR Press / Rutgers University
and
The Scarecrow Press, Inc.
Metuchen, N.J., & London
1993

British Library Cataloguing-in-Publication data available

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Industrial relations theory : its nature, scope, and pedagogy / edited by Roy J. Adams and Noah M. Meltz.
p. cm. — (Institute of Management and Labor Relations series : no. 4)
Includes bibliographical references.
ISBN 0-8108-2678-X (alk. paper)
1. Industrial relations—Methodology. 2. Industrial relations—Study and teaching. I. Adams, Roy J. II. Meltz, Noah M. III. Series.
HD6961.I5594 1993
331—dc20 93-9898

Copyright © 1993 by Roy J. Adams and Noah M. Meltz
Manufactured in the United States of America
Printed on acid-free paper

Contents

INTRODUCTION

Understanding, Constructing, and Teaching Industrial Relations Theory
Roy J. Adams 1

TEACHING INDUSTRIAL RELATIONS THEORY

Designing an Industrial Relations Theory Curriculum for Graduate Students
Paula Voos 17

A Framework to Organize Theory: The Structure of a Doctoral-Level Seminar on Industrial Relations Theory
Joel Cutcher-Gershenfeld 43

THE NATURE AND SCOPE OF THE SUBJECT

The Founders of Industrial Relations as a Field of Study: An American Perspective
Jack Barbash 67

Is Euro-American Union Theory Universally Applicable? An Australasian Perspective
Kevin Hince 81

Industrial Relations: Theorizing for a Global Perspective
Michael Poole 103

THE RELATIONSHIP BETWEEN INDUSTRIAL RELATIONS AND THE SOCIAL SCIENCES

"All Aspects of People at Work": Unity and Division in the Study of Labor and Labor Management
Roy J. Adams 119

Industrial Relations Systems as a Framework for Organizing Contributions to Industrial Relations Theory
Noah M. Meltz 161

Integrating Industrial Relations and the Social Sciences
Steve M. Hills 183

PARADIGMATIC APPROACHES TO INDUSTRIAL RELATIONS

Industrial Relations and Theories of Interest Group Regulation
Braham Dabscheck 227

Theorizing Industrial Relations: The Dominance of Logical Positivism and the Shift to Strategic Choice
Viateur Larouche and Michel Audet 255

Theory and Method in Industrial Relations: Modernist and Postmodernist Alternatives
John Godard 283

Industrial Relations Theory: A Political Economy Perspective
Craig R. Littler 307

CONSTRUCTING INDUSTRIAL RELATIONS THEORY

Theory Construction and Assessment: A Checklist
Roy J. Adams 333

Teaching and Building Middle Range Industrial Relations Theory
Thomas A. Kochan 353

Integrative Theory Building: A Personal Account
Hoyt N. Wheeler 381

Index 395

Index

Accumulation system, 322-23
Adams, Roy J., 175-76, 186, 265-66, 268, 354, 374
AFL-CIO, 370
Alientation: theory, 71, 187; of the worker, 25, 77
"American Shoemakers" (Commons), 84
Anomie, 27, 71, 77
Arbitration, 72, 88, 367; compulsory, 86, 91, 98, 366
Arbitration Court, 87-88, 90, 91
Arbitration system, 95-96, 246
Arbitration unions, 92, 95-96, 98-100
Armstrong, E. G. A., 267, 269
Audet, Michel, 11, 12
Australasia, 8, 81, 98, 136
Australia, 6, 11, 81-100, 136, 139, 144, 148, 228, 229-37; constitution, 230-31; constitutional conferences, 86
Australian Council of Trade Unions, 237, 2441
Authoritarianism, 193, 215, 371

Bain, G. S., 268, 343
Barbash, Jack, 2, 3, 5-6, 23, 25, 84, 140, 162, 164-65, 266, 267, 361
Bargaining, 71, 211; internal, 165; multilateral, 366; political, 170, public sector, 365-68; theory, 5, 186-87, 243, 247
Barkin, D., 235-36, 267
Behavioralists, management-oriented, 21
Behavioral Theory of Labor Negotiations, 362
Berkowitz, Leonard, 384, 388
Bernstein, M. H., 121, 236, 238-39, 243
Beveridge, Lord W., 75, 107
Beyond Contract (Fox), 315, 370
Braverman, Harry, 50, 143-44, 269, 315, 321
Brown, William Bethro, 233-35
Burawoy, Michael, 50, 269, 316
Burrell, G., 11, 255-56, 259-65, 270

Canadian Industrial Relations Association, 138-39, 143
Capitalism, 22, 45, 68-69, 71-73, 75-76, 83-84, 98, 143, 205, 262-63, 291, 319, 320-21, 343; alienation under, 24; overthrow of, 177; victimization of labor, 68
Cappelli, Peter, 5, 262, 267, 269, 364
Capture theory, 240-43, 247

Central planning, 193, 196-97, 215
Challenges and Choices Facing American Labor (Kochan), 364
Chamberland, N., 266
Class conflict, 57, 84, 94, 195
Classical economics, 73, 120-21
Clegg, H. A., 5, 267, 268
Collective bargaining, 8, 19-20, 24, 27, 29, 46, 70, 72, 74, 77, 105, 108, 111-12, 130-31, 135, 137-38, 141, 172, 263, 266-67, 270-72, 283, 286-87, 314, 319, 335, 344, 355, 363-67, 369, 373, 375; regulation of, 134, 176-77
Collective Bargaining and Industrial Relations (Kochan), 23, 286-87, 360
Commons, John R., 5, 20-21, 25, 46, 59, 70, 72-77, 84, 93, 98, 122, 211, 266, 353, 354-56, 358, 361-62, 372-73
Commonwealth Conciliation and Arbitration Act 1904, 83, 86, 94
Commonwealth Court of Conciliation and Arbitration, 229-30, 233-34, 237, 241, 243, 247
Compensation, 20, 88, 114, 121, 203, 229, 314
Competition, 84-85, 137; global, 106; national, 112
Conceptual framework, 188-96, 219-20
Concession bargaining, 24, 364
Conciliation Board, 88, 90
Conflict, 220, 291; assumption, 49-51, 53, 60, 65; industrial, 114, 383, 387; of interests, 199, 261, 263; state control of, 86; theory, 186, 188, 198; violent, 354
Conflict resolution, 26, 264, 268
Consensus assumption, 51-54, 60, 65
Contract of employment, 171, 194, 217, 241
Control, 215-17, 220-21
Convergence, 103-8, 111-13, 116; hypothesis, 5, 7, 145, 343
Corporatism, 20, 26, 103, 142, 170
Corporatist: government, 193; policies, 173
Cox, Robert, 146, 267
Craig, A., 162, 164-65, 168-73, 178, 260, 263, 267
Cutcher-Gershenfeld, Joel, 4, 5, 333

Dabscheck, Braham, 10, 14, 267
Deconstruction technique, 13
Deindustrialization, 56
Democratic model, 84
Derber, Milton, 149, 266, 355, 376
Deregulation, 113
Developing world, 145-46, 149
Dimmock, S., 269, 272
Disciplinary approach, 266-67
Dispute resolution, 204
Diversity, 104, 108-16, 120; in the workforce, 375-76
Donovan Commission, 136
Dragons of Eden, The (Sagan), 382
Dunlop, John T., 9, 21, 22, 25, 26, 47, 54, 124, 126, 145, 150, 161-62, 164-65, 168-72, 179, 188, 263, 267, 270, 334, 343, 355, 361, 362, 376

Dunlopian systems framework, 5, 10, 126-27, 130, 164-65, 188, 270, 286, 308, 363
Durkheim, Emile, 27, 71, 77, 353
Dyer, L., 130, 269

Economic Community, 373
Economic determinism, 70
Economic development, 144-45
Education and training, government subsidized, 198, 200-201
Efficiency, 6, 140, 164, 165, 214, 358, 371
Einstein's Theory of Relativity, 333-34, 344-47
Employment Contracts Act of 1991, 97-98
Employment relationship, 184-89, 264-67, 270; control of by capitalist firms, 195, 199, 207, 211; control of by government, 192-95, 198, 203-4, 206, 211; control of by labor, 211; control of by market, 193-95, 197, 199, 203, 206-7; control of by union leaders, 192-93, 195; shared control of, 196
Engels, Friedrich, 69, 121, 228
Equilibrium model, 244
Equity, 6, 68, 70, 73, 76-77, 84, 140, 164-65, 205, 358, 371; theory, 20
Exchange paradigm, 13, 308-15, 327
Explanation in Social Science (Meehan), 337
External environment, 168-69, 171, 173-75

Faberology, 151
Flanders, Alan, 5, 150, 267, 268, 314
Flexible specialization, 14, 62, 316, 320-21, 323-24, 326-27, 372-73; theorists, 25
Fordism, 14, 316, 318-19, 323-24
Fox, Alan, 5, 48, 268, 314-15, 370-71, 374
Fraser, Malcolm, 230, 240
Freeman, Richard B., 27, 56, 308, 314, 361-62
Free market, 187, 189-90, 202-3, 206, 214; economist, 193; theory, 194
French Regulation School, 143, 148
Friedman, Milton, 54, 361
Functionalist paradigm, 258-62, 270, 272
Future of Industrial Societies (Kerr), 105

Gidden, Anthony, 289, 301
Gill, C. G., 267, 268
Godard, John, 13, 272
Goodman, J. F. B., 137, 267, 269
Gouldner, A., 133, 289
Government, 191; policy, 178, 185; role of, 227-28, 246-47
Gramsci, Antonio, 49, 121, 361
Grievance mechanisms, 171
Gunderson, M., 267-68
Gurr, Ted Robert, 387, 391

Hameed, S., 267, 268
Harbison, Frederick, 25, 26, 124, 145, 343

Hawke, Bob, 139, 237
Health and safety legislation, 131, 135, 228
Heneman, H. G., 264, 268
Hermeneutics, 12, 301
Higgins, Henry Bournes, 233, 237-38, 245, 247
Hills, Steve, 3, 10, 268
Hince, Kevin, 6, 7
Historians, labor, 25, 59
History: of industrial relations, 67-77, 121-22, 130, 360-61; influence on decisions, 173; labor, 122, 134, 148-49, 376
History of Labor in the United States, The (Commons), 122
Howard, W. A., 6, 81-82, 85-86, 88, 90, 96, 99, 246
Hoxie, Robert, 5, 21, 25, 70, 74-77, 122
Human capital theory, 200, 203, 220
Humanist paradigm, 257
Human relations, 25, 71, 76-77, 123, 125
Human resource: allocation and utilization, 202-10, 220-21; development, 197-202, 219-20; maintenance activities, 211-14
Human resource management, 4, 8-9, 19-20, 29, 62, 76, 112-14, 120, 127-28, 131, 135-37, 141-42, 148, 171-72, 207, 221, 265-66, 269, 272, 283, 358, 369, 374-76
Human rights legislation, 131, 135
Hyman, Richard, 26, 50, 220, 269, 360

Immiserization thesis, 321
Impact of Collective Bargaining on Management, The (Slichter, Healy, and Livernash), 361
Impasse resolution, 366-68
Industrial Conciliation and Arbitration Act 1894, 83, 86-90, 93-95, 97, 246
Industrial Conflict: An Integrative Theory (Wheeler) 381
Industrial democracy, 134-35, 197
Industrialism and Industrial Man (Kerr, Dunlop, Harbison, and Myers), 26, 104, 145
Industrial justice, 214
Industrial policy, 206
Industrial psychology, 29, 123, 135, 148
Industrial Relations Commission, 235, 237
Industrial Relations, Origins and Patterns of National Diversity (Poole), 7, 110
Industrial Relations Research Association, 1, 2, 8, 15, 21, 57, 120, 124-26, 128-30, 132-34, 138-139, 141, 143, 145, 147, 149
Industrial Relations Systems (Dunlop), 161-62, 362
Industrial sociology, 133-34, 137, 148
Industrial tribunals, 229-37, 241-42, 244-47
Inflation, 340-41, 344-45
Institutional: approach, 267; assumptions, 54-56; economists, 138, 198, 219; framework, 18; labor economics, 73, 121, 134, 147; tradition, 30, 145, 289
Institutionalism, 3, 4, 20-23, 25-26, 124, 142, 197
Interdisciplinary study of labor and labor management, 126-27, 148

Japan: influence of, 14, 107, 114, 131, 141, 320-21, 327; management methods, 325-26, 327
Job satisfaction, 25, 187, 339-40
Joskow, P. L., 243-44

Katz, Harry, 5, 62, 162, 164-65, 168-70, 172-74, 179, 269, 287, 308, 364, 369
Kaufman, Bruce, 20, 127, 130, 354, 362
Kelly, William Raymond, 234, 239
Kerr, Clark, 25, 26, 104-6, 108, 124, 145, 268, 343, 355, 362, 376
Kirby, Sir Richard, 239-40
Kochan, Thomas, 3-5, 9, 15, 20, 23, 44, 62, 129-30, 162, 164-65, 168-70, 172-74, 179, 262, 269, 272, 286, 308
Korpi, Walter, 26, 269
Kuhn, Thomas, 12, 285, 293, 363

Labor and Monopoly Capital (Braverman), 143-44, 315
Labor law, 19, 134-35, 137, 148
Labor-management relations, 14, 133, 139-44, 187
Labor markets, 20, 25-27, 56, 137, 139, 186, 219, 265; dual, 186-87; externam, 205; internal, 26, 56, 186-87, 200, 205
Labor movement, 21-22, 25, 125
Labor parties, 205-6
Labor problems, 122, 130, 138, 148
Labor process, 143-44; literature, 315-19, 326-27; theorists, 14, 25, 359
Labor regulation, 322-23
Labor relations, 263, 265-67, 270, 321
Laffer, Kingsley, 150, 266
Larouche, Viateur, 11, 12, 268
Legal Foundations of Capitalism, The (Commons), 122
Legislation, 175, 177-78, 240
Leibenstein, H., 310-12
Lenin, V. I., 27, 49, 361
Lester, Richard A., 25, 124, 355
Life-cycle theory, 236-40, 247
Lipset, Seymour Martin, 62, 168
Littler, Craig, 11, 13-14
Livernash, E. Robert, 355, 361
Logical empiricism, 290, 292-94, 298
Luxemburg, Rosa, 49, 361

McGregor, Douglas, 25, 51, 361
McKersie, Robert B., 5, 47, 48, 62, 162, 164-65, 168-70, 172-74, 179, 262, 269, 308, 362, 365, 369, 376
Maddern, Justice (Barry), 239, 241, 245
Market-driven economy, 197, 344
Markets, 62, 106
Marx, Karl, 3, 5, 6, 21, 23, 25, 45, 49, 68-70, 73, 75-77, 84, 121, 143, 177, 353, 356, 358, 361, 362, 386
Marxism, 24, 49, 68-69, 76, 83
Marxist: analysis, 144; condemnation of capitalism, 22; framework, 10, 18;

perspective, 13, 46, 49-51, 145, 168, 177-79, 183, 186-88, 321, 343, 346; research, 149; theorists, 10, 12, 21, 132, 162, 185, 190, 195, 196, 21215, 218-19, 359, 386
Mass production, 62, 318, 323
Mayo, Elton, 5, 25, 70-71, 76-77, 123, 133
Mechanization, 317-18, 323
Medoff, James L., 27, 56, 308, 314, 361, 362
Meehan, Eugene, 337, 338, 343
Meltz, Noah M., 2, 10, 140, 267, 334
Merton, Robert K., 57, 353
Middle range theory, 353, 354, 362, 370
Mitchell, D. J. B., 130, 269
Mixed-motive: assumption, 48-49, 60, 63, 65; literature, 4, 53; perspective, 46, 358, 370
Midernism, 285, 296
Monopoly, 165, 189-90, 196, 215
Morgan, G., 11, 255-56, 259-65, 270
Myers, Charles, 25, 26, 124, 145, 343, 355

Negotiation, 171, 185, 190-92, 198-99, 204, 206, 211-12, 214, 217, 220
Neoclassical economics, 18, 21, 25, 26, 28, 73, 148, 203, 218, 240, 358-59, 386; of labor, 130, 132, 134; perspective, 54-56, 310
Neoclassical market theory, 20, 22, 241
Neoclassical realists, 124, 142, 145
Neocorporatism, 142-43, 373
Neo-Fordism, 316
Neoinstitutionalism, 20, 26, 60, 132-33, 148
New Deal, 60-64, 76
New Rules of the Sociological Method (Giddens), 289
New Zealand, 6, 81-100, 136, 139, 144

Objectivism, 285, 288, 290, 294, 297-98, 301
Olson, Mancour, 27, 54
Organizational behavior, 9, 20, 29, 120, 127, 128, 131, 133, 135, 147, 148, 358-59

Perlman, Selig, 5, 20, 21, 22, 25, 46, 59, 74, 84, 93, 98, 267, 354, 361
Personnel management, 123, 128, 131, 135
Piore, Michael J., 25, 62, 323-25, 364, 369, 370, 372
Pluralism, 4, 10, 12, 20, 26, 46-49, 53, 134-35, 137, 176, 203, 207, 211, 268, 344, 370-71
Pluralists, 45, 50, 60, 162, 177, 184, 192, 195-96, 220
Polanyi, K. 83, 215
Political: action, 212; lobbying, 90-92, 178, 194, 237, 241; process, 173; system, 168, 177-78
Political economy, 13, 142-43, 148-49, 178-79, 293, 308, 315; paradigm, 309-15, 327
Poole, Michael, 7-8, 267
Positivism, 11, 13-14, 293
Postmodernism, 12, 284, 295-301

Power, 260, 309-10; conflict, 269; distribution of, 109-11, 170, 314; labor, 143-44; relations, 262, 264
Productivity, 344, 347
Public interest theory, 232-36, 247

Radical: approach, 262, 269, 272, 293; labor research, 11, 133; literature, 4; perspective, 176, 184; theorists, 196, 308
Radical change, 256-57
Rationalism, 285, 288, 290, 294, 296-98, 301
Rationality principle, 70, 77
Regulation, 241-43, 246, 267, 270; assumption, 256; literature, 308, 327; theory, 11, 14, 228-29, 315, 319-26, 373
Regulatory agencies, 232-33, 236-38, 240, 244
Reynolds, Lloyd G., 25, 27, 124
Rorty, Richard, 284, 296
Ross, Arthur M., 25, 355
Rules and rule-making, 263-64, 268, 270

Sabel, Charles F., 25, 62, 323-25, 364, 369-72
Schatz, Ronald, 362, 376
Schmitter, Philippe C., 26, 142
Scientific management, 70, 75-77
Scientific method, 284-88, 301
Scientific socialism, 68, 75
Second Industrial Divide, The (Piore and Sabel), 364, 370
Selections from a Prison Notebook (Gramsci), 361
Sethi, A. S., 269, 272
Set theory, 334
Shifting Gears (Katz), 364
Slichter, Sumner, 5, 74, 77, 354, 355, 361
Smith, Adam, 54, 312
Social action, 12, 284, 288-90, 294, 298
Social dominance hierarchies, 382, 387
Socialism, 22, 71, 74, 103; planned economy, 206; Soviet, 6, 68, 113, 193; Soviet-style, 69, 72
Socialists, 121, 177-79
Social Organization of Strikes, The (Batstone, Boraston, and Frankel), 289
Social Reform and the Church (Commons), 122
Social System of the Modern Factory, The (Warner and Low), 133
Sociobiology (Wilson), 383
Sociology, 57-58, 151
Somers, Gerald, 150, 266, 357
Soviet Union, 113, 215
Special interest groups, 236-38, 240-42
Standard Hours and Basic Wage case, 234, 243
Stigler, G. J., 240-43
Strategic choice, 9, 15, 141, 170-71, 174, 179, 262, 272, 364, 369, 372-73
Strauss, George, 266, 268, 269, 383, 390
Strike action, 26, 87, 88, 91, 92, 94, 95-96, 114, 163, 174, 291, 294, 340-41, 363

Structuralist paradigm, 257, 259, 272
Structure of Scientific Revolutions, The (Kuhn), 12, 285
Supply and demand, 132, 240
Systems: approach, 266, 267; framework, 164-79, 184, 186

Tannenbaum, Frank, 21, 71, 84-85
Taylor, Frederick, 5, 25, 70, 71, 75-77, 123
Taylorism, 14, 70, 123, 316, 319
Taylor Law, 366-67
Technological: change, 174, 218, 342; developments, 115, 190, 323; paradigm, 324; trends, 107
Technology, 7, 105, 106, 169, 318-19; new, 108, 206, 324; shifts in, 62
Thatcher government, 99, 112, 136-38
Theoretical realism, 284, 290-95, 301-2
Theory checklist, 336-48
Transformation of American Industrial Relations (Kochan, Katz, and McKersie), 364, 368, 369
Tripartite: bargaining, 204; consensus, 142; consultation, 105; negotiation, 198; policies, 173
Trust relations, 371-72, 376

Union-management relations, 10, 128, 139, 147-48, 271-72
Union membership, 88-89, 93, 197, 339-41, 344-45; compulsory, 89-90, 92, 96-97; decline in, 8, 18, 24, 29, 113, 364, 371; white collar, 343
Unions, 6-8, 29, 46, 56, 60, 70, 71, 73-75, 77, 105, 108, 113, 122, 130-31, 135, 137, 138, 163, 165, 169, 175-78, 184, 186-87, 190-91, 194, 202, 204-5, 215, 217, 219, 241, 246, 263, 307-9, 314, 338, 342-44, 347, 363, 372, 375, 376; apprenticeship, 199-200, 202; in Australia and New Zealand, 6, 81-100; decline in density, 283, 308; decline of influence, 113, 130, 174; deregistering of, 95; Euro-American theories, 83-85; impact of, 27; as instruments of the state, 7; mass, 307; methods, 72; multidistrict, 93; mythology of, 87; regulation of, 134; role of state in, 96-97, 99
Union Policies and Industrial Management (Slichter), 361
Unitarist, 4, 162, 175-77
Unitary: assumptions, 51-54, 138, 150; perspective, 176-77, 179, 374

Voos, Paula, 2-5

Wage and price controls, 142, 230
Walton, Richard E., 47, 48, 269, 362, 365
Webb, Beatrice and Sydney, 5, 21, 24-25, 46, 71-72, 75-76, 83, 122, 177, 267, 308, 356, 358, 361, 373
Weber, Max, 5, 57, 69-70, 76-77, 297, 300, 312, 353, 376
What Do Unions Do? (Freeman and Medoff), 361
Wheeler, Hoyt, 3, 15
Why Men Rebel (Gurr), 391
Whyte, William Foote, 140, 362
Wildcat Strike (Gouldner), 289
Williams, R. J., 239, 243
Winchester, D., 137, 266

Windmuller, John, 335-36, 339
Witte, Edwin, 125, 354
Women in the workplace, 12, 375
Wood, S., 267, 269
Woods, N. S., 89-90, 96

Yoder, D., 264, 268